

CALFED BAY-DELTA PROGRAM PEER REVIEW PROCESS FOR ECOSYSTEM RESTORATION PROJECTS

Draft 1/7/00

Information, reports and data generated by projects funded through CALFED's Ecosystem Restoration Program will be peer reviewed for technical and scientific merit. The primary objective of scientific and technical review is to assure scientific quality, prevent release of inadequate submissions, and expedite the transfer of information to scientists and the public.

Information, reports and data will be sent out to at least three peer reviewers. At least one will be either an agency or stakeholder scientist, and at least one will be an independent academic or consultant scientist. No more than two peer reviewers may be employees of the CALFED agencies. Peer reviewers cannot be employees or colleagues of the project authors or their agency.

Peer review comments will be made available to the investigator or author. The author will be asked to address and incorporate the peer review comments. Responses by the investigator or author about how each comment was addressed will be published with the information, report or data and will be maintained in project files. If the investigator or author does not address the peer review comments, the peer review comments will be included with the information, report or data when released to the public. Final peer reviewed products will be made available through the CALFED web site.

Peer review questions will include the following:

- Is the research question clearly defined and appropriately answered?
- Is the overall design of the study adequate?
- Are the methods (field collection, lab, statistics) adequately described and the best methods for the type of study?
- Are the interpretations and conclusions warranted by and sufficiently derived from or focused on the data?
- Are the references up to date, relevant and complete?

Not all of these questions will be relevant for non-research papers. Discretion will be used in reviewing other types of information, reports, and data.

Scientific and technical peer reviews will be coordinated by CALFED. CALFED will involve as peer reviewers appropriate scientific experts based on national and international standards and criteria. The appropriate use of reviewers outside CALFED will ensure the independence of the peer review. Peer reviewers will be selected by CALFED.

The CALFED peer review guidelines will be periodically reviewed to determine their effectiveness, and modified as necessary to ensure a high standard of scientific information generated by the CALFED Program.